

**THE CITY OF FORT MYERS
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MINUTES OF THE MAY 26, 2022, MEETING**

On May 26, 2022, at 4:00 p.m., the City of Fort Myers Historic Preservation Commission met in the City Council Chambers, Oscar M. Corbin, Jr. City Hall, 2200 Second Street, in the City of Fort Myers, Florida.

ROLL CALL

Mary Jo Walker called the meeting to order at 4:28 p.m.

Members Present

Mary Jo Walker
Michelle Santucci
Sawyer Smith
Lisa Belcher

Members Absent

Carly Schwartzel
Kevin Williams
Lynn Stewart
Gina Sabiston
Joe McKenzie

Planning Staff Present

Anthony Palermo, Assistant Director
Taryn Thomas, Senior Planner

Other Staff

Grant Alley, City Attorney
Liston Bochette, Councilman Ward 4
Christian Gempesaw, ITS Department

**Minutes - Historic Preservation Commission
May 26, 2022**

Grant Alley, City Attorney, swore in all witness that intended to speak on any of the agenda items.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: It was moved to approve the minutes from March 24, 2022, by Ms. Belcher, seconded by Mr. Sawyer, and unanimously approved 4-0.

AGENDA ITEM NO. 1: PUBLIC HEARING: CERTIFICATE OF REVIEW COR22-0066, 3809 MCKINLEY AVE., SEMINOLE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT: REPLACE WOODEN STEPS AND LANDING WITH CONCRETE.

EX PARTE COMMUNICATION: None

Anthony Palermo, Assistant Building Director, Community Development Department, stated that staff findings were as follows:

BEGIN STAFF REPORT

**AGENDA ITEM #1
CERTIFICATE OF REVIEW# COR22-0066
ADDRESS 3809 McKinley Avenue**

HISTORIC DISTRICT
Seminole Park Historic District

HISTORIC NAME
None

PROPOSED PROJECT

Replace wooden steps and landing with concrete.

DATES	CASE HISTORY
07/20/98	The City designated the Seminole Park area as a Historic District.
04/25/06	An application to replace the asphalt shingle roof with a stone coated steel tile roof.
05/27/21	New metal roof

STAFF FINDINGS

Architectural / Historical Elements

1. The property located at 3809 McKinley Avenue is a two-story contributing structure in the Seminole Park Historic District constructed in 1925.
2. The application proposes to replace the existing wood steps and landing with concrete.

LAND DEVELOPMENT CODE AND DESIGN GUIDELINES:

**Minutes - Historic Preservation Commission
May 26, 2022**

Staff concludes after a site visit and a review of the documents in this application, that Land Development Code, Chapter 114 Historic Preservation, Section 114-72 Review criteria for existing buildings is applicable to this application, specifically:

Sec. 114-72 Review criteria for existing buildings.

For maintaining, improving, and expanding existing buildings, evaluation of applications for certificates of review will consider the design guidelines described below as applied to the alteration and building in question. These design guidelines are found in Chapter II of the *Design Guidelines for Historic Properties*.

- (a) Criteria for maintenance and improvements.
- (6) **Porches.** Porches should retain their original configuration and materials.

DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR HISTORIC PROPERTIES, CHAPTER II. DESIGN GUIDELINES

K. PORCHES

The retention of the original porch configuration is very important for houses in a Historic District. A porch is one of the main defining features of a house, and it often signifies a building's age and style. Replacement with matching materials is essential. Wood porches and porch steps should not be replaced with brick, ironwork, concrete, or concrete blocks. Insensitive porch alteration compromises the overall appearance of a structure and disturbs its size and scale.

4. Repair and Replacement

Porch elements which are deteriorated should be repaired or replaced with matching materials, wherever possible. The use of outdoor carpeting or artificial turf that will be readily visible is strongly discouraged. The original porch railings should be retained, wherever possible. If additional railing height is required, simple metal or wooden extensions should be utilized so that the original historic configuration can be maintained.

SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION

- 9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

STAFF REVIEW

**Minutes - Historic Preservation Commission
May 26, 2022**

After a site visit and a review of the documents in this application, staff concludes the following:

1. The structure is considered a contributing within the Seminole Park Historic District.
2. The existing wood stairs are not original to the house. Other contributing structures of similar architectural style within Seminole Park have concrete or masonry entry stairs.
3. The proposed concrete steps and landing at the front door will have no negative impact on the historic character of the structure or on the character of the district.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Staff makes a finding that the proposed concrete stairs and landing complies with the City of Fort Myers Land Development Code, Chapter 114, Section 114-72 (a)(6), as well as standard 9 of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
2. Staff recommends to the Historic Preservation Commission the approval of the Certificate of Review, Application COR22-0066.
3. The proposed improvements shall be installed as indicated in this Certificate of Review application.
4. All required permits shall be obtained prior to construction.
5. This Certificate of Review will become effective immediately.

END STAFF REPORT

PUBLIC INPUT: None

DISCUSSION: Ms. Santucci asked if the opening that was now screened in used to be fully open. Mr. Palermo advised that was correct.

MOTION: It was moved by Ms. Belcher to approve Certificate of Review COR22-0066, 3809 McKinley Ave., Seminole park historic district: replace wooden steps and landing with concrete, seconded by Mr. Sawyer, and unanimously approved 4-0.

ITEM NO. 2 MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS: Tom Hall, public Art consultant, asked the board if they had gathered a list of proposed buildings to put into the Ottocast application. Ms. Walker advised that staff had the list and would need to present it at the next meeting.

ITEM NO. 3: PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS: Tim Dennis, resident of Dean Park, stated that it was understood that the board would not be able to make a decision on his request, however that he was there with a cry for help for his community. Mr. Dennis stated that his concern was for the building at 2801 Michigan Avenue which was at the vantage point of Palm Avenue which was a residential street. Mr. Dennis stated that the property did not appear to be in a commercial district. Mr. Dennis stated that the property did not comply with section six of the Land Development Code that referred to deviations. Mr. Dennis stated that the property did not meet the requirements of the setbacks and stated that it did not meet many

**Minutes - Historic Preservation Commission
May 26, 2022**

requirements that he felt should be met. Mr. Dennis asked the commission to help stop the construction at 2801 Michigan Avenue.

Mr. Sawyer advised the speaker that he only had three minutes to speak.

Ms. Walker advised that any other public speakers present were permitted to allocate their speaking time to Mr. Dennis.

Mr. Dennis stated that the property had metal siding which was not normally permitted, and that the property should have gone through a new public hearing since it was a Planned Unit Development. Mr. Dennis questioned if the building permit for the property should have been issued.

Ms. Walker advised that the Historic Preservation Commission was not able to act on his request as it was not in their purview.

Mr. Dennis asked the board to use their resources that they personally had to help promote his request among council members or the mayor's office and to bring awareness to the request to anyone that can help stop the construction of the property.

Ms. Walker advised that the persons wishing to speak on the request needed to present their concerns to the City Council Board or the Planning Board.

Mr. Palermo advised that some of the public had made the same presentation at the Ward 1 meeting in which he had attended and that they had also presented their concerns to the Building, Zoning, and Advisory Committee as well.

Sarah Burke, Palm Avenue resident, stated that her view from the front of her home would be obstructed if the proposed construction at 2801 Michigan Avenue were to proceed. Ms. Burke advised that the construction would bring in a significant amount of traffic. Ms. Burke asked if the proposed warehouse as it was pictured would have multiple uses permitted to be within it instead of just the proposed self-storage use.

Mr. Sawyer read all the prohibited and permitted uses for the property at 2801 Michigan Avenue.

Ms. Walker advised that the concerned residents needed to present their case at the next City Council meeting.

Ms. Santucci stated that the public as the property owners needed to question why a variance was approved and needed to go before the correct persons to present their concerns and requests. Ms. Santucci asked if she was permitted to state her suggestions.

Grant Alley, City Attorney, advised that the board was permitted to discuss the issue.

Ms. Burke stated that the building was advertising itself as open space for multiple types of businesses within the warehouse and not just self-storage and questioned if all the things being marketed was permitted by right.

**Minutes - Historic Preservation Commission
May 26, 2022**

Ms. Santucci advised that was not the Historic Preservation Commission's purview but suggested printing off all the pages that Ms. Burke had seen advertised for the warehouse and bring the concern before the City Council.

Rick Janis, Dean Park resident, spoke about the success that the Dean Park association had with branding their name.

ITEM NO. 4: COUNCILPERSON UPDATE: Councilman Bochette gave an update on the following subjects:

- McGregor Boulevard Resurfacing, reconstruction, and improvements
- McGregor Boulevard Budget limits
- The Flats at City Walk
- Creating a new historic district on McGregor Boulevard with the buildings that front McGregor Boulevard

OTHER BUSINESS:

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:21 o'clock p.m.