

**MINUTES – AUDIT COMMITTEE AND
SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING
RFQ #0062-23**

July 31, 2023

1 | Page

The Audit Committee of the City of Fort Myers, Florida, met in regular session at Oscar M. Corbin, Jr. City Hall, 2200 Second Street, a meeting place in the City of Fort Myers, Florida, on Monday, July 31, 2023, at 5:00 p.m. Present were: Chair/Councilperson Darla Bonk, Vice Chair/Councilperson Teresa Watkins Brown, Mayor/Committee Member Kevin B. Anderson, Committee Member Daniel Acheampong. Also present were City Attorney Grant Alley, City Clerk Gwen Carlisle, Melinda Pensinger, Internal Audit Manager, Christine Tenney, Director of Financial Services, Eduardo Strazzeri, Deputy Finance Director, Assistant City Manager John Lege, III, and Kirk Zimmerman, Senior Procurement Specialist.

CALL TO ORDER/PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: Chair Bonk called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m. and led in the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL: Absent: None

PUBLIC COMMENTS (limited to 3 minutes) - None.

1. COMMITTEE MEMBER FOCUS AREAS, COMMENTS AND CONCERNS

1.1 Evaluate proposals for financial auditing services, rank, and recommend firms for City Council selection of an independent CPA firm to audit the City's financial statements. (Selection Committee Meeting, RFQ 0062-23) (Kirk Zimmerman, Senior Procurement Specialist).

Mr. Zimmerman asked that any person in attendance regarding this Selection Committee review for RFQ 0062-23 please sign in for the record. He advised that this portion of the meeting is to review and score responses for Financial Auditing Services RFP 0062-23, and recommend to City Council in order of preference, no fewer than three firms that are most qualified to perform the services established pursuant to criteria set forth in the RFP. He stated that this is a public meeting and is being recorded. Mr. Zimmerman noted that the non-voting Selection Committee members were seated at the dais so that they have a microphone available. Non-voting Selection Committee members included Christine Tenney, Director of Financial Services, Eduardo Strazzeri, Deputy Finance Director, Assistant City Manager John Lege, III, and Melinda Pensinger, Internal Audit Manager.

Mr. Zimmerman asked that any member of the Selection Committee disclose if they have any financial or personal relationships with any of the submitting firms regarding this project. Audit Committee Members Bonk, Anderson, Watkins Brown, and Achaempong stated they have had none. Mr. Zimmerman asked the Non-voting Selection Committee members Chris Tenney, Eddie Strazzeri, John Lege, and Melinda Pensinger, if they have had any financial or personal relationships with any of the submitting firms, and they answered they have none.

Mr. Zimmerman reported that the City of Fort Myers had received a total of 8 responsive submittals on July 21, 2023, from the following firms:

- Carr, Riggs & Ingram, LLC
- Christopher, Smith, Leonard & Stanell, P.A.
- CliftonLarsonAllen LLP
- Marcum, LLP

**MINUTES – AUDIT COMMITTEE AND
SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING
RFQ #0062-23**

July 31, 2023

2 | Page

- Maudlin & Jenkins, LLC
- MSL, P.A.
- Purvis, Gray and Company, LLP
- RSM US LLP

The following criteria were used to evaluate the proposals:

Qualifications and Experience: 25 points.

Audit Approach: 25 points.

Ability to Furnish Services: 25 points.

Price for Services: 25 points.

Mr. Zimmerman advised that once the score sheets have been turned in to him, they will take a brief recess and he will tally the scores. He will then read the results and at that time the Selection Committee can decide collectively on a recommendation, or they can ask the top ranked proposers to make presentations to this Committee at their next scheduled meeting August 7, 2023. If the Committee decides they want presentations, those presentations will be based on the same criteria as established in the RFP. If the Audit Committee members want presentations, they can email him any questions they would want addressed during the presentations. The questions will be sent to all the firms at the same time so each firm will have time to prepare their presentation. Mr. Zimmerman opened the floor for any general discussion prior to the scoring. There being no discussion, he asked the Audit Committee voting members to read their scores aloud based on the criteria.

	Qualifications & Experience	Audit Approach	Ability to Furnish Services	Price	Total
Daniel Acheampong	25	25	25	25	100
Carr, Riggs, & Ingram, LLC	20	25	22.25	25	92.25
Christopher, Smith, Leonard & Stanell, P.A.	25	22.5	24.75	20	92.25
CliftonLarsonAllen, LLP (CLA)	25	22.5	22.25	20	89.75
Marcum, LLP	22.5	22.5	24.75	20	89.75
Maudlin & Jenkins, LLC	22.5	22.5	24.75	17.5	87.25
MSL, P.A.	20	22.5	22.25	22.5	87.25
Purvis, Gray and Company, LLP	22.5	22.5	22.25	15	82.25
RSM US LLP	22.5	22.5	24.75	12.5	82.25
Mayor Kevin Anderson					
Carr, Riggs, & Ingram, LLC	18	22	24	25	89
Christopher, Smith, Leonard & Stanell, P.A.	18	21	21	25	85
CliftonLarsonAllen, LLP (CLA)	19	22	25	15	81
Marcum, LLP	18	25	24	23	90
Maudlin & Jenkins, LLC	20	24	21	23	88

**MINUTES – AUDIT COMMITTEE AND
SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING
RFQ #0062-23**

July 31, 2023

3 | Page

	Qualifications & Experience	Audit Approach	Ability to Furnish Services	Price	Total
MSL, P.A.	19	24	24	25	92
Purvis, Gray and Company, LLP	25	19	25	18	87
RSM US LLP	25	21	21	17	84
Councilmember Darla Bonk					
Carr, Riggs, & Ingram, LLC	20	21	20	23	84
Christopher, Smith, Leonard & Stanell, P.A.	20	20	21	23	84
CliftonLarsonAllen, LLP (CLA)	23	23	24	19	89
Marcum, LLP	20	23	23	20	86
Maudlin & Jenkins, LLC	24	23	24	22	93
MSL, P.A.	22	21	24	23	90
Purvis, Gray and Company, LLP	23	23	24	24	94
RSM US LLP	23	23	23	20	89
Councilmember Teresa Watkins Brown					
Carr, Riggs, & Ingram, LLC	22	22	23	23	90
Christopher, Smith, Leonard & Stanell, P.A.	20	23	23	23	89
CliftonLarsonAllen, LLP (CLA)	21	23	23	23	90
Marcum, LLP	25	23	24	23	95
Maudlin & Jenkins, LLC	21	20	22	21	84
MSL, P.A.	18	23	23	21	85
Purvis, Gray and Company, LLP	22	20	21	19	82
RSM US LLP	23	22	22	19	86

Mr. Zimmerman asked for a short recess to tabulate the scores.

Chair Bonk recessed the meeting at 5:21 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 5:34 p.m.

**MINUTES – AUDIT COMMITTEE AND
SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING**

RFQ #0062-23

July 31, 2023

4 | Page

	Daniel Acheampong	Mayor Kevin Anderson	Councilmember Darla Bonk	Councilmember Teresa Watkins Brown		
					Totals	Rank
Carr, Riggs, & Ingram, LLC	92.25	89	84	90	355.25	2
Christopher, Smith, Leonard & Stanell, P.A.	92.25	85	84	89	350.25	5
CliftonLarsonAllen, LLP (CLA)	89.75	81	89	90	349.75	6
Marcum, LLP	89.75	90	86	95	360.75	1
Maudlin & Jenkins, LLC	87.25	88	93	84	352.25	4
MSL, P.A.	87.25	92	90	85	354.25	3
Purvis, Gray and Company, LLP	82.25	87	94	82	345.25	7
RSM US LLP	82.25	84	89	86	341.25	8

Mr. Zimmerman read for the record the total points for each firm, noting that the top three proposers are Marcum, LLP 360.75 score, Carr, Riggs & Ingram, LLC 355.25 score, and MSL, P.A. 354.25 score. He asked the Committee if they would want presentations from the top three proposers. Chair Bonk asked the non-voting members if they can work with any of these three firms. Non-voting member Christine Tenney, Director of Finance, stated that she can work with them, but they will move forward to Council with the top ranked firm, Marcum, LLP, noting that they are in the Top 12 of National firms. Committee Member Anderson stated that he also had those firms as the top three, but not necessarily in that order.

MOTION: Committee Member Anderson moved to consider recommending to Council the top three ranked firms, and no presentations are needed at this time to the Audit Committee; seconded by Vice Chair Watkins Brown; motion passed unanimous.

Mr. Zimmerman noted that he will adjourn the Selection Committee meeting portion of the meeting at 5:40 P.M.

2. TIME & PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Chair Bonk noted that the Audit Committee is scheduled to meet August 7, 2023, 3:00 p.m. in Council Chambers.

3. PROPOSED AGENDA TOPICS FOR NEXT MEETING

**MINUTES – AUDIT COMMITTEE AND
SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING**

RFQ #0062-23

July 31, 2023

5 | Page

Ms. Pensinger noted that the discussion for the next meeting will be governance document development, Internal Audit function, and the Audit Committee.

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Bonk adjourned the meeting at 5:42 p.m.