

**THE CITY OF FORT MYERS
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MINUTES OF THE SEPTEMBER 28, 2023, MEETING**

On September 28, 2023, at 4:00 p.m., the City of Fort Myers Historic Preservation Commission met in the City Council Chambers, Oscar M. Corbin, Jr. City Hall, 2200 Second Street, in the City of Fort Myers, Florida.

ROLL CALL

Gina Sabiston called the meeting to order at 4:01 p.m.

Members Present

Gina Sabiston
Lynn Stewart
Mary Joe Walker
Lisa Belcher
Sawyer Smith
John McKenzie

Members Absent

Raimond Aulen
Azil Malan
Michelle Santucci

Planning Staff Present

Nicole DeVaughn, Planning Manager
Juanita Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

Other Staff

Grant Alley, City Attorney
Liston Bochette, Councilman Ward 4
Christian Gempesaw, ITS Department

Grant Alley, City Attorney, swore in all witnesses that intended to speak on any of the agenda items.

AGENDA ITEM NO. 1 CERTIFICATE OF REVIEW COR23-0129, 2210 BAY STREET/1410 BAYVIEW COURT, DOWNTOWN HISTORIC DISTRICT: MODIFY FAÇADE, NEW DOORS & WINDOWS.

EX PARTE COMMUNICATION: None

Nicole DeVaughn, Planning Manager, Planning Division, Community Development Department, stated that staff findings were as follows:

BEGIN STAFF REPORT

AGENDA ITEM # 1

CERTIFICATE OF REVIEW# COR23-0129
ADDRESS 2210 Bay Street/1410 Bayview Court

**Minutes - Historic Preservation Commission
September 28, 2023**

HISTORIC DISTRICT

Downtown Historic District

HISTORIC NAME

N/A

PROPOSED PROJECT

Renovate the non-historic façades on Bay Street and Bayview Court. New windows and doors are proposed for all openings. The stucco finish on the Bay Street façade around the entrance will be replaced with painted brick with wood accents.

DATES

CASE HISTORY

02/27/98	The City designated the Downtown area as a Historic District.
06/30/98	Removed as a contributing structure by the Commission due to extensive alterations and age of building. An application to renovate the façade was also approved.
07/27/06	Exterior renovation approved.
06/26/14	Application to replace the doors and windows and install new storm protection was approved.

STAFF FINDINGS

Architectural / Historical Elements

1. The property located at 2210 Bay Street (previously 2210 and 2214 Bay Street) is within the Downtown Historic District and is a non-contributing structure within the district. The buildings were originally constructed in 1957 [2210 Bay St.] and 1947 [2214 Bay St.]. The property at 1410 Bayview Ct. is developed as a paved courtyard with metal fence and gates.
2. The proposal is to remove and replace all of the doors and windows on the northern and eastern facades. The existing french doors on the eastern façade will be removed, opening size reduced, and the double doors will be replaced with sliding windows.
3. At 1410 Bayview Court, the application proposes to create a new single doorway towards the southern end and reduce the size of the opening and replace the existing double doors.

LAND DEVELOPMENT CODE AND DESIGN GUIDELINES:

Staff concludes after a site visit and a review of the documents in this application, that Land Development Code, Chapter 114 Historic Preservation, Section 114-72 Review criteria for existing buildings is applicable to this application, specifically:

Sec. 114-72 Review criteria for existing buildings.

For maintaining, improving, and expanding existing buildings, evaluation of applications for certificates of review will consider the design guidelines described below as applied to the alteration and building in question.

**Minutes - Historic Preservation Commission
September 28, 2023**

- (a) Criteria for maintenance and improvements.
 - (3) **Replacement windows and doors.** Replacement windows and doors should respect the original character of historic buildings by retaining the original configuration and details of windows and doors.

P. REPLACEMENT WINDOWS AND DOORS

The placement and relationship of windows and doors are often critical parts of the style of a building. The demands of modern energy efficiency and security standards often lead owners of older buildings to consider replacement windows. These guidelines are designed to accommodate replacement windows in a manner that respects the original character of historic properties.

1. Replacement windows and doors should retain the same configuration and details as the originals.
2. Replacing panes with stained, leaded, or beveled glass is acceptable as long as the configuration remains the same.
3. Metal replacement doors may be acceptable as long as they are of the same configuration as the original door. These metal doors should be painted or clad to match the trim of the house.
4. All replacement windows should have either true divided lights, or molded exterior muntins, if appropriate. Flat or interior false muntins are not in keeping with the character of older structures. Muntin design should reflect the original window configuration. False muntin bars, if used, should be applied to the exterior of the new windows.
5. Ideally, window and door openings should not be reduced or enlarged in size. Alterations to window and door openings should remain in proper proportion to the overall design of the building.
6. Sensitively designed exceptions to these guidelines will be considered by the Historic Preservation Commission when such proposals are conceived to accommodate the adaptive reuse of older buildings or to conform to the provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act.
7. Glass block replacement windows should be installed only on side or rear elevations not readily visible from the street.

SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

**Minutes - Historic Preservation Commission
September 28, 2023**

STAFF REVIEW

After a site visit and a review of the documents in this application, staff concludes the following:

1. The structure is considered a non-contributing structure within the Downtown Historic District.
2. The original façade was removed in 1998 and the existing façade was added. There are no historic elements remaining on the building.
3. The doors and windows will be replaced with Storm Smart, bronze with clear glass, storefront system. The proposed door and window changes are as follows:
 - a. Fixed glass windows on Bay Street (northern) façade will be replaced with sliding Storm Smart windows of the same size.
 - b. Wood framed front door (Bay Street) will be replaced with a Storm Smart, bronze with clear glass, storefront door with sidelights.
 - c. French doors on Bayview Court (eastern façade) will be removed and replaced with sliding windows to match the Bay Street façade. The bottom portion of the existing doorway openings will be filled and covered with a stucco finish. The existing single door will also be replaced.
 - d. New transom windows will be installed to match the proposed doors and windows.
 - e. Double doors in the courtyard (1410 Bayview Court) will be removed, the opening decreased in size and new Storm Smart storefront double doors installed.
 - f. The existing single door south of the double doors will also be replaced with a smaller single door.
4. The main entry façade on Bay will be refaced with painted brick with wood accents around the windows flanking the door. Wood accents will run the length of the remaining stucco façade under the windows.
5. New externally lit signage is proposed in the existing sign band area above the front entry on Bay Street.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Staff makes a finding that the proposed alterations to the facades comply with City of Fort Myers Land Development Code, Chapter 114, Section 114-72 (a)(3) as well as Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation 9.
2. Staff recommends to the Historic Preservation Commission the approval of the Certificate of Review, Application COR23-0129 with the conditions as follows:

**Minutes - Historic Preservation Commission
September 28, 2023**

- a. The color of the door and window frames shall be dark bronze with clear glass.
- b. The alterations shall be as shown on page A202 of the elevations prepared by GMA Architects & Planners dated August 04, 2023. The renovations shall also be in substantial compliance with the renderings prepared by KDL Interior Design contained in this application.
3. The proposed alterations shall be completed as indicated in this Certificate of Review application.
4. All required permits shall be obtained prior to commencement of construction.
5. This Certificate of Review will become effective immediately.

END STAFF REPORT

Cole Peacock, applicant, stated the proposed project will renovate the building to accommodate a new elevated farm to table restaurant using produce, meats, and seafoods from around Florida.

Zachary Smith, architect with GMA Architects/Planners, stated proposed windows will look similar to the existing and will be sliding windows instead of fixed. Mr. Smith stated the existing french doors cannot be used because they swing outward into the alley right-of-way. Mr. Smith stated the french doors will be replaced with a knee wall and sliding windows matching the front façade.

Ms. Sabiston asked City Attorney Grant Alley if Mr. [Sawyer] Smith could vote on the item as a family member is on the design team for the applicant.

Mr. Sawyer Smith stated the relevant Florida Statutes are about pecuniary interest and do not include siblings.

City Attorney Alley confirmed Mr. Smith was not required to recuse himself for this public hearing.

PUBLIC INPUT: None

DISCUSSION: Ms. Sabiston stated she supports the project but is concerned if every building downtown has the same windows, it will have the appearance of a new development instead of each building having a unique, imperfect, character.

Mr. Peacock stated they were using similar windows and did not want to go too far out of the box. He stated if acceptable, they would be willing to go with a funkier design.

Mr. McKinzie stated the Commission does not have purview over paint colors.

MOTION: It was moved by Walker to approve COR23-0129, for 2210 Bay Street/1410 Bayview Court with staff recommendations 1 through 5, seconded by Mr. Smith and unanimously approved 6-0.

ITEM NO. 2: PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS: None

**Minutes - Historic Preservation Commission
September 28, 2023**

ITEM NO. 3 MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS: Ms. Stewart stated she found a company that can do complete window restorations, which could be a great resource for others.

Ms. Sabiston asked City Attorney if the Commission could create a list of potential resources that could be provided to the public.

Mr. Alley stated such a list, with disclaimers that none are endorsed by the Commission, could be acceptable. Mr. Alley stated no one would be required to use anyone from the list in order to obtain a Certificate of Review.

Mr. Smith left the meeting at 4:32 p.m.

ITEM NO. 4: COUNCILPERSON UPDATE: Councilman Bochette spoke on the following points during the councilperson update:

- McGregor Boulevard pothole at Coconut Drive.
- Naples Botanical Gardens survey of Royal Palms along McGregor Blvd.
- Brick crosswalk on McGregor Blvd at the Edison Ford Winter Estates.
- Possibility of using artwork within the crosswalks.
- Providing information between boards and commissions.
- Mosaic on the new apartments near Langford Kingston house.
- Rachel at the Well reconstruction.
- Boats still on City property one (1) year after the hurricane.
- City Council workshop to discuss selling the downtown post office parking lot.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:44 o'clock p.m.